# Wind and Time in Homeric Epic\*

# ALEX C. PURVES

University of California, Los Angeles

SUMMARY: This paper examines the relationship between wind, narrative, and time in Homer. It begins by considering Fränkel's observation that weather rarely occurs outside the similes in the *Iliad*, and goes on to show that wind plays a subtle but fundamental role in shaping the narratives of both the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey*.

"IN THE *ILIAD*, THERE ARE NO SEASONS, AND THERE IS HARDLY ANY WEATHER ... [Homer] causes storms, rain, and snow almost exclusively in the simile," wrote Hermann Fränkel in 1921. But what does it mean to think of the plain at Troy as a weatherless space? How are we to read it alongside the storm-tossed and wind-swept landscapes of the similes? If wind occurs almost only in the similes of the *Iliad*, should we then posit some formal or temporal connection between description and the weather? To answer yes, on the grounds that the simile, like the weather, belongs to the everyday, to the descriptive, to the "background effects" of heroic action, is perhaps partially correct, but it also underplays the significance of both elements in the poem. In this paper, I investigate the role of the wind in a broad range of contexts in Homeric epic,

\* Sheila Murnaghan first discussed the ideas in this paper with me and helped me with its conception. Since then, it has benefited from discussions followings its presentation at the universities of Harvard, Texas, Pennsylvania, Columbia, and Berkeley. I am indebted to the audiences at each of those institutions for their questions and comments. I also thank David Blank, Sherrylyn Branchaw, Joy Connolly, Anne Duncan, Kathryn Morgan, Seth Schein, Charles Stein, and Mario Telò as well as my anonymous readers for their substantial help with earlier drafts of this paper.

<sup>1</sup> Fränkel 1921: 102. Translation from Fränkel 1997: 108–9. Fränkel also astutely observes that descriptions of the weather at Troy do occur in the *Odyssey* (14.475–6; 24.42), which only accentuates their absence from the *Iliad* (1997: 110). In the similes of the *Iliad*, on the other hand, "weather is even more violent than war" (Redfield 1994: 190).



Figure 1. Auguste and Louis Lumière, still from *Repas de bébé* (1895). Photograph Association Frères Lumière. Reproduced by permission.

arguing that it plays a complex and unexpectedly forceful role in shaping the narratives of the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey*.

#### BACKGROUND: THE WIND IN THE TREES

First, a short introduction is in order on the topic of weather as "background," particularly in reference to the wind. A suggestive illustration of this phenomenon can be found in an early Lumière film, entitled *Repas de bébé* (*Feeding the Baby*). The premise of the film is simple—it is no more than a 45-second documentary of Auguste Lumière and his wife enjoying breakfast outside with their small child.

The extent of the scene is clear from the still shown in Figure 1: mother drinks a cup of coffee, baby eats, father smiles and feeds the child. The three figures form a tableau that is animated through the use of film in a way that is revolutionary for its time, yet nothing much happens. Interestingly, however, it was not the smiling portrait of the happy family that the audience reacted to when the film was first shown in Paris in 1895. Instead, the spectators, many of whom were watching a moving picture for the very first time, were said to be captivated by the unexpected intrusion of a fourth figure into the scene. For they spoke afterwards of being "wonderstruck" by the movement

of the leaves on the trees blowing in the wind behind the family. So Gorky, in his description of the experience, remarked on the uncanny and startling effect of how "silently the ash-grey foliage of the trees swayed in the wind."<sup>2</sup> Film critics have argued that the leaves attracted so much attention because their movement captured, for the first time, "something quintessentially cinematic ... an acute example of cinema's capacity to register a world as if caught 'off-guard [or] unposed."<sup>3</sup>

The movement of the leaves dramatizes the moving picture's ability to capture two registers of time at once—one structured by the idea of breakfast, family, or human time, as we watch the baby learn to eat and grow, and the other by the natural ongoing rhythms of the world outside, the continuum of the wind that gusts and lulls. This wind is generally ever present *and usually invisible*. The moving camera's special ability to reveal things that were previously unremarkable to the human eye adds a second, subtle layer of movement to the scene. The unscripted aspect of the trembling leaves impacts the narrative and its apparent focus.

By chance, the wind picks up as the film goes along, blowing the baby's collar and the father's napkin up into the air. In this way, the wind ruffles the director's careful orchestration of the scene, introducing an element of surprise. What early cinema suddenly made clear, therefore, was wind's ability to break through the script and to add layers of temporal and narrative complexity to a carefully arranged tableau. In the film there is always the possibility, hovering around the child's billowing collar, that the wind might make something happen.

The audience's reaction to the trembling leaves in this early film is so intriguing because it defamiliarizes wind for us, drawing our attention to an element that we ordinarily take for granted or that recedes into a kind of invisibility in the background. The role of the wind also illustrates suggestive differences between the two narrative modes of film and poetry.<sup>4</sup> Just

<sup>2</sup> Jean-Louis Comolli: "people were wonderstruck by the trembling of the leaves on the trees—a good example, since the wind bloweth where it listeth—which produced an effect, an effect of the real." Both quotations are from Stern 2004: 413–14. The film can be viewed easily on any number of internet sites (e.g., http://www.institut lumiere.org/francais/films/1seance/1seance07.html).

<sup>3</sup> Stern 2004: 415. The wonder of the audience here is quite different from the wonder and terror felt by those watching the Lumière film *Arrival of a Train at the Station*, which was shown just weeks later in Paris (January 1896). See further Gunning 1989.

<sup>4</sup> In the one, a complete scene can be instantly presented and brought to life. In the other, we must rely on the time-bound process of verbalization in order to communicate a select number of details about a scene.

as Chatman has argued that there can be no pure "description" in cinema, because the verbal nature of description calls for a freezing of narrative time which is impossible as long as the camera is still running, so here we find that even the background effects of a filmed scene play on, surprisingly, in time. The capability of either medium to represent the weather, and the way in which each does so, thereby point to a generally overlooked component of how stories reach horizontally through space and time.<sup>5</sup>

## WIND, ACTION, AND SIMILE IN THE ILIAD

With this in mind, what are we to make of the startling absence of wind in the *Iliad*, or, more precisely, why is the wind there displaced onto the figurative space of the simile? Are Homer's winds the kind that flutter in the background or the kind that gust in with storms and gales, and what connection can be drawn between these two very different types? I will argue that in Homeric epic a quiet tension exists between the two, and that storms and background winds together contribute a sense of temporal integration and depth to the

<sup>5</sup>Chatman 1980: 129: "[I]n the movie version, the sense of continuing action could not stop." Although Chatman does not pay sustained attention to the wind, it is notable that in his comparison of Maupassant's short story "Une Partie de campagne" and Jean Renoir's film adaptation of the same name, the breezes play quite different roles. In the former, Chatman tells us how "'[t]he curtain at the back [of the cart] ... fluttered in the breeze like a flag' ... 'Fluttered' is an active verb, but from the textual point of view, the sentence is pure description; it is not tied into the event chain" (1980: 124). In the film version of this scene, however, there is no curtain flapping in the wind (125). Instead, the wind shows up elsewhere, such as when it waves the skirt of the woman on the swing (133).

<sup>6</sup>On the vivid or pictorial nature of the simile, cf. Edwards 1987: 102–10; Bakker 2001; Minchin 2001. On the use of nature in the similes, and the "window" they provide to an outer world, see Redfield 1994: 186–92.

<sup>7</sup> The semantic range of Homeric wind is broad, ranging from the most neutral and pervasive term, ἄνεμος (wind), to πνοιή (breath, breeze, blast), αὔρη (breeze), οὖρος (favorable wind for sailing), ἀϋτμή/ἀϋτμήν (breath of wind), ῥιπή (rush of wind), ἀήτης (blast), ἀέλλη (whirling or stormy wind), θύελλα (rushing stormwind), λαῖλαψ (storm). The direction that the wind comes from—North (Boreas), South (Notos), East (Euros), and West (Zephyr)—often tells us something not only about spatial coordinates but also its type or personality. A related issue concerns the divinization of wind, as in the scene at *Il.* 23.192–230 (on which, and on the whole topic of the winds' personality there, see especially Kakridis 1949: 75–83). When winds have personality, it makes them not just actants but also actors, playing their own roles in Homer's already multifaceted plots. In both epics, the North and West winds appear most frequently and have the most developed personalities.

landscapes of the poems.<sup>8</sup> Although scholars have shown that stormwinds are often the instigators of plots or markers of key moments in a narrative (this is especially true for sea poems), the *Iliad* does something rather different when it sets its storms within the background of the similes.<sup>9</sup>

We are familiar with the kinds of wind that occur in the Homeric simile from the frequency of verses such as "As when along the hallowed threshing floors the wind scatters / chaff" (*Il.* 5.499) or "As when the West wind moves across the grain deep standing, / boisterously, and shakes and sweeps it till the tassels lean" (*Il.* 2.147–48).<sup>10</sup> As is clear from these and other examples, epic wind indicates movement, not only in and of itself, but also through the object—perhaps dust, wheat, leaves, or the sea—that it affects. Conversely, an absence of wind denotes a special kind of serene stillness, as the following example shows (*Il.* 5.522–27):

άλλ' ἔμενον νεφέλησιν ἐοικότες ἄς τε Κρονίων νηνεμίης ἔστησεν ἐπ' ἀκροπόλοισιν ὅρεσσιν ἀτρέμας, ὄφρ' εὕδησι μένος Βορέαο καὶ ἄλλων ζαχρειῶν ἀνέμων, οἵ τε νέφεα σκιόεντα πνοιῆσιν λιγυρῆσι διασκιδνᾶσιν ἀέντες· ὡς Δαναοὶ Τρῶας μένον ἔμπεδον οὐδὲ φέβοντο.

But [they] stayed where they were, like clouds, which the son of Kronos stops in the windless weather on the heights of the towering mountains, motionless, when the strength of the North wind sleeps, and the other tearing winds, those winds that when they blow into tempests high screaming descend upon the darkening clouds and scatter them. So the Danaans stood unmoving against the Trojans, nor gave way.

<sup>8</sup> Compare the use of wind, air, and breezes in Virginia Woolf's *To the Lighthouse*, especially in the passage quoted by Auerbach in the last chapter of *Mimesis* (2003 [1953]: 525–53). In a celebrated passage in the novel, Mrs. Ramsay's complaint about the number of doors that have been left open in her summer house centers on the problem of what the wind brings with it when it is allowed inside—sand, leaves, but also time, which ages and decays. Yet the circulation of the air in the house also makes possible the circulation of Mrs. Ramsay's stream of consciousness, as her mind moves through the rooms and so from one thought to another. This effect of air and wind in the story, what we might call a "background effect," is contrasted by the novel's central crisis—that Mrs. Ramsay's family will not be able to sail to the lighthouse if a storm or bad weather causes the wind to be too strong.

<sup>9</sup> On stormwinds as instigators of plots, see, e.g., Hardie 1986: 90–97, and further references in n62, below.

<sup>10</sup> See further Scott 1974: 190–205 and my nn13 and 14, below. Translations of Homer are taken, with adjustments in capitalization and occasional modifications, from Lattimore 1951 and 1965.

In this passage, the stillness that is achieved because the strength of the North wind "sleeps," in the simile, is analogous to the resistance of the Achaeans to the Trojan onslaught. Here, as so often in the *Iliad*, the force of the wind in the simile indicates the presence or absence of action on the plain.

At "windy" (ἡνεμόεσσα) Troy itself, however, the wind blows only indirectly. After the successful sailing that returns Chryseis to her father, the Achaean ships remain hauled up on the shore for the full length of the poem, facing not sea breezes but the metaphorical storms of violence and warfare that are stirred up on the plain. These ships frame the action, and the gusts from the similes that beat against them only serve to emphasize the Greeks' inability to move forward beyond their present circumstances. They put the Achaeans in the position, as Odysseus suggests, of stranded sailors "whom the stormwinds of winter and the sea rising keep back" (*Il.* 2.293–94). Although the conditions are in fact almost exactly opposite, the ships' extended presence on the shore recalls the delay at Aulis, where the Greek ships were detained for lack of a good wind before the *Iliad* had even begun. The strands of the ships of the ships were detained for lack of a good wind before the *Iliad* had even begun.

Yet the wind also works as a symbolic and powerful force through the *Iliad*'s battle books, creating a regenerative momentum for the action through similes that compare the heroes and the onslaught of battle to the violent effects of wind. As the army prepares for action in books 2–4, many of the similes that describe them are motivated by wind. In the course of the fighting that ensues, we see Hector frequently compared to a whirlwind or storm as he breaches the ships, and the Achaeans to men who brace themselves against a furious oncoming wind. As Whitman has put it, this wind "blows harder and

<sup>11</sup> Only once in the *Iliad* do the Achaeans turn their faces to a breeze that comes from the sea, to refresh themselves before returning to battle (*Il.* 11.62).

<sup>12</sup> In the archaic and classical periods two explanations for the delay at Aulis co-existed: too much wind or an absence of wind. Homer does not mention which kind held the army from their expedition (he mentions the gathering at Aulis at *Il.* 2.303). The story from the *Cypria* is that Artemis rouses stormy winds (Procl. *Chrest.*; Apollod. *Epit.* 3.21), and crosswinds are the cause in Aeschylus's *Agamemnon* (147, 191).

<sup>13</sup> *Il.* 2.144–51, 2.394–97, 3.10–14, 4.275–82, 4.422–28; Scott 2005: 23–29.

<sup>14</sup> Redfield 1994: 190–91: "weather appears in the similes most often as an image of pure force unleashed in the world." It is applied to different heroes individually, such as Agamemnon (II. 11.155–58), Nestor (11.747), Patroclus (16.384–86), and especially Hector (11.297–98, 11.305–9, 12.40, 15.623–28), as well as to groups of fighters or the pitch of battle itself (12.132–34, 12.156–59, 12.278–83, 12.375–76, 13.39, 13.333–38, 13.795–801, 14.394–401, 15.381–84, 15.617–22, 16.364–67, 16.765–70, 17.735–41); cf. the Achaeans who are said to "breathe fury," μένεα πνείοντες (11.508, 24.364), as they fight. In the majority of cases wind in similes applies to the force of battle, but it can also apply to psychological turmoil (9.4–8, 14.16–20, cf. 10.5–10).

harder as Hector's attack nears its climax," culminating in a concentration of wind similes in books 11 and 12.<sup>15</sup> In book 11, two similes that occur in close proximity provide a good example of the many comparisons of Hector to a turbulent storm (11.297–98, 305–9):

ἐν δ' ἔπεσ' ὑσμίνη ὑπεραέϊ ἶσος ἀέλλη, ἥ τε καθαλλομένη ἰοειδέα πόντον ὀρίνει.

[Hector] hurled himself on the struggle of men like a high-blown storm-cloud, which swoops down from above to trouble the blue sea-water.

ώς ὁπότε νέφεα Ζέφυρος στυφελίξη άργεστᾶο Νότοιο, βαθείη λαίλαπι τύπτων πολλὸν δὲ τρόφι κῦμα κυλίνδεται, ὑψόσε δ' ἄχνη σκίδναται ἐξ ἀνέμοιο πολυπλάγκτοιο ἰωῆς ὡς ἄρα πυκνὰ καρήαθ' ὑρ' Έκτορι δάμνατο λαῶν.

As when the West wind strikes in the deepening whirlstorm to batter the clouds of the shining South wind, so that the bulging big waves roll hard and the blown spume scatters high before the force of the veering wind's blast, so the massed high heads of the people were struck down by Hector.

The incidents of storms or winds within the action of the *Iliad's* plot are considerably fewer. Twice the gods send real winds to increase the tumult of battle, and at the beginning and end of the poem they send benevolent winds to usher Chryseis back home and to light Patroclus's funeral pyre. <sup>16</sup> Yet the Odyssean *ouros*, the favorable wind that helps plots (like ships) to travel forward, shows up only three times in the *Iliad*. <sup>17</sup> For most of the poem, the endless back-and-forth of the fighting on the plain is represented by the kind of storm imagery that buffets narrative momentum and does not drive the plot in a meaningful direction. <sup>18</sup> The symbolic stormwinds of the *Iliad*, in

<sup>15</sup> Whitman 1958: 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Zeus sends a whirlstorm down on the battle at 12.252–54, and Hera promises to bring a troublesome storm from the sea at 20.333. The benevolent winds are at *Il.* 1.479, 23.192–218.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Cf. *Il.* 1.479. The other two instances of *ouroi* in the *Iliad* occur in similes: 7.5, 14.9. Compare the importance of the *ouros* as a device for shepherding Telemachus safely through his adventures in the *Odyssey*, or Pindar's use of the term to signal the "favorable wind" of song at *Pyth.* 4.1–3 (cf. *Nem.* 6.28b, *Ol.* 13.28, *Pyth.* 1.34–35, 4.291). I thank Anna Bonifazi for discussion on this topic.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> As Alcaeus memorably put it (fr. 326.1–5 LP), if you are in the middle of a storm it is difficult to see which way the wind is blowing. It is no surprise, then, given Zeus's

other words, make clear all the sailing that is *not* occurring in the poem and the distances that are not being traveled from place to place.

There is, however, another kind of wind, which is very prominent in the action of the battle books and which enriches the significance of the wind that blows in the similes. This is the wind that comes with breath. The words πνοιή, ἀΰτμή, and ἀΰτμήν are all used by Homer to describe both external gusts or breezes and the internal breath that moves through the body. The writers of treatises such as *On the Sacred Disease* and *On Breath or Winds* understood breath to be the "wind of the body" (*On Breath or Winds* 3.3)<sup>20</sup>:

πνεῦμα δὲ τὸ μὲν ἐν τοῖσι σώμασι φῦσα καλέεται, τὸ δὲ ἔξω τῶν σωμάτων ὁ ἀήρ.

Wind inside bodies is called breath and outside bodies is called air.

The affinity between breath and wind in the *Iliad* is exhibited most clearly by the action of the North wind in restoring Sarpedon's breath to him after he has fallen in battle (*Il.* 5.696–98)<sup>21</sup>:

τὸν δ' ἔλιπε ψυχή, κατὰ δ' ὀφθαλμῶν κέχυτ' ἀχλύς· αὖτις δ' ἐμπνύνθη, περὶ δὲ πνοιὴ Βορέαο ζώγρει ἐπιπνείουσα κακῶς κεκαφηότα θυμόν.

And the mist mantled over his eyes, and the life left him, but he got his breath back again, and the blast of the North wind blowing brought back to life the spirit gasped out in agony.

Here, the verb used to describe Sarpedon's regaining of his breath, ἐμπνύνθη, is related through the \*pneu- root to ἐπιπνείουσα, which describes the North wind's action in restoring Sarpedon to life by blowing wind into him, as well as to πνοιή, the word for the "breath" or "gust" that Boreas breathes. <sup>22</sup> The

opaque and changeable plan in the poem, that the plain at Troy seems to the warriors like a storm.

 $<sup>^{19}</sup>$  E.g., ἀϋτμή: *Il.* 9.609, 10.89, 21.366; *Od.* 11.400 = 407; ἀϋτμήν: *Il.* 23.765; *Od.* 3.289; πνοιή: *Il.* 11.621–22, 20.438–40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> My translation. Cf. *On the Sacred Disease* 7 and 16. On the sustained thematic connection between wind and breath in Aeschylus's *Oresteia*, see Scott 1966: 461.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> See further Smith 1966: 551 and nn12-16; Barra-Salzédo 2007: 17-43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> See Frisk 1954–60 and Chantraine 1968–80 s.v. πνέω, ep. πνείω. The only sure cognate outside Greek is in Germanic. Old Norse *fnýsa*, "pant and blow noisily," and Old English *fnēosan*, "sneeze" go back to the root \**pneu*-. Greek derivatives include πνοή, πνοιή, ἄπνοος, πύρπνοος, -πνοια, πνεῦμα, πνεῦσις, ἄπνευστος, εἴσπνηλος, εἰσπνήλας, εἰσπνεῖν.

language and the action of this scene converge at the point where wind and breath become one. The repetition of the  $\pi v$ - and  $\pi$ -sounds, as well as the  $\kappa$ ,  $\phi$ , and  $\theta$  of the final three words, must have created short bursts of breath when sung aloud, paralleling Sarpedon's own labored struggles to gasp the air back into his body. The process of animation—of wind bringing an object to life—reflects on what we previously discussed about the Lumière film. From here, it is easy to see the connection between the Greek word ἄνεμος, the Latin *animus*, and the principle of animation.<sup>23</sup> The coincidence of breath, speech, and action that occurs as Sarpedon comes back to life concentrates the effect and urgency of the scene.

The wind that animates the battle portions of the narrative thereby makes its force felt in a variety of ways. It is present not only in the gusts that blow through the similes but also in the breath of the actors fighting on the plain. In the pitch of battle, Homer calls our attention to the stopping and starting of that breath and the controlled efforts to regain it.<sup>24</sup> The poet's emphasis on the labor of breathing in the narrative reverberates on through his use of the wind in the similes. The vacuum that is left by the absence of actual wind on the plain is filled by this human activity of breathing, leading to a charged integration of the poem's figurative and physical spaces. The breath of the god thematically links the two, as when Athena, breathing very gently ( $\mathring{\eta}$ ka  $\mathring{\mu}$ a $\mathring{\lambda}$ a $\mathring{\psi}$ b $\mathring{\xi}$ a $\mathring{\sigma}$ a), wards off Hector's spear with a breath ( $\mathring{\pi}$ voi $\mathring{\eta}$ ) that must have manifested to humans as a breeze (Il. 20.438–40).

If we consider how wind works in the similes of the battle books and contrast it with the way that it works in the human body that is striving for life on the Trojan plain, it is clear that a tension exists between the time of the simile and the time of heroic action. The wind of the simile belongs to an unspecified place and time, while the act of breathing is crucially linked to the realm of the here and now.<sup>25</sup> Breath is only noticeable when it is in short sup-

<sup>23</sup> One might say a little more about κεκαφηότα θυμόν (the final two words in this passage). Κεκαφηότα is the perfect participle of καπύω, a verb that may be related to καπνός, "smoke" (Lat. *fumus*). If an etymological connection between Greek θυμός and Latin *fumus* can be posited (cf. Chantraine 1968–80 s.v., who doubts the relationship, primarily for semantic reasons) then there is still more air in this passage than is initially evident.

<sup>24</sup> As when Hector struggles for breath or gets his wind back after sustaining an injury (*Il.* 11.359, 11.383, 14.436, 15.10, 15.241), when there is a need for a catching of breath or breathing space in the battle (11.800, 16.42–43, 18.200–1, 19.227), and when the breath of the horses is brought to our attention (13.386, 16.506).

<sup>25</sup> This is not to dispute scholarship on the sense of vividness and present tense that comes through the simile (Martin 1997; Bakker 2001), yet it is clear that that vividness is all the more remarkable for its ability to take the audience *out* of the scene of battle and to bring another time and place before its eyes.

ply, meaning that when the act of breathing is highlighted on the battlefield it focuses our attention on the physical aspect of the warrior's strenuous passage through present time. The wind that the hero breathes in and out paces him and controls the range of his movement across the plain.

Scholars have argued that there is so great a concentration of similes in the battle books because both poet and audience need to escape from the stifling atmosphere created by the repetitive sequence of dueling and death (e.g., Porter 1972). Indeed, the shortness of breath that occurs in the pell-mell of fighting contributes to this claustrophobic environment and is connected to the shortness of breath that comes at the moment of death. The simile relieves this sense of a scarcity of air and time by creating a pause within the furor of battle, a surplus of breath that stretches time out, allowing even the most rapid moments of action on the plain to expand for as long as it takes for the simile to come to an end. As Martin 1997: 147 has suggested, the simile also shifts the rhythm and layering of the epic in oral performance. In narrative terms, the winds in the similes thereby have a double effect on the pace of the poem. Not only do they generate their own kind of energy or momentum, as when the wind literally or figuratively propels the action forward, but they also create bursts of action, pauses, and extended breathing spaces as they are transmitted through the poet's voice, an entity that is transported, as if on wings, by the movement of the air.<sup>26</sup> The wind and its relationship to human breath have an effect on the pacing of the action in the *Iliad* by imagistically creating lulls and gusts in the fighting as well as on the pacing of the story in as much as the simile temporarily stills the action within the narrative's "descriptive pause." 27

Viewed through the context of the battle books, therefore, three winds emerge within the *Iliad*'s landscape: the gust of wind in the simile, the breath

<sup>26</sup> Words move, by means of the breath, from the φρήν of the speaker out of the mouth and fly, "winged" (πτερόεντα), through the air, until they finally settle in the φρήν of the listener (Lesher 1981: 16). These words can be described as "windy" and the fence of the teeth is sometimes unable to restrain them.

<sup>27</sup> As Fränkel puts it: "Through a simile, the bard can dwell on a subject for longer and so to speak double the narrative's impact, when otherwise it would simply hurry him along" (1997: 104), or Scott: "[Similes] slow down the action rather than advancing it" (1974: 4), or Martin: "Slow motion is obtained both in Homeric narrative and in the *Aspis* by the device of the simile, which acts like a freeze-frame, pausing the action as the poet develops another, analogical argument to interpret the scene within the scene" (2005: 162, although cf. Martin 1997, esp. 146–47). Coffey 1957: 132 says that similes "vary the tension of the narrative." On the rhetorical device of the descriptive pause, see, among others, Genette 1976; Fowler 1991.

of the warrior on the plain, and the breath of the poet's voice as he performs. <sup>28</sup> For the *Iliad*, I have tried to show how these three elements work as a series of layers that shade between background and foreground in the poem. This can also help to variegate our initial discussion of the Trojan plain as a "weatherless" space. Rather, the *Iliad* is balanced by a system of alternating winds and breaths that serve to animate and regulate a charged, violent arena in which, on the one hand, there is *too* much activity (too much fighting and killing) and, on the other, not enough momentum or movement in a specific direction (the ships with their furled sails). With this reading of the *Iliad* in mind, let us now turn to the movement of the wind in the *Odyssey*.

### STORMTOSSED ODYSSEUS

Between the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey*, the wind's representation moves from one that is primarily located in the world of the similes to one that literally blows the hero through certain books of the plot.<sup>29</sup> It is no wonder that this epic contains a great deal fewer similes than the *Iliad*; the action of the poem is now doing much of the work that the *Iliad* used the simile to accomplish.<sup>30</sup> But this also means that the breezes that blow through the *Odyssey* are no longer mostly figurative; indeed, we find a number of winds that move through it in purposeful and directed ways.

The association between wind and plot in the *Odyssey* is strengthened by the fact that wind is represented largely through divine intervention in that poem. In the Telemachy, we learn that the various *nostoi* of the Greek heroes are mostly determined by the gods' control of the winds. Thus Telemachus, Agamemnon, and Nestor all make expeditious journeys thanks to the divine *ouroi* that fill their sails,<sup>31</sup> while Menelaus, Ajax, and Odysseus are either

<sup>28</sup> There is much that could be said here about the role of wind and breath in poetic inspiration, which is figured in Hesiod as a divine breath that comes directly from the Muses (Hes. *Theog.* 31–32: ἐνέπνευσαν δέ μοι αὐδὴν/ θέσπιν). See further Rosen 1990 on the metapoetics of sailing at *Op.* 648–49 and Dougherty 2001 on the affinity between song and ship.

<sup>29</sup> Wofford 1992: 120. Note in particular that the winds that push unwilling sailors far from their loved ones, which appear in a simile at *Il.* 19.377–78, offer us a direct glance at the *Odyssey*.

<sup>30</sup> Edwards 1987: 103 states succinctly the *communis opinio* for the smaller number of similes in the *Odyssey*: "Perhaps one of the reasons there are fewer similes in the *Odyssey* is that its setting is closer to this everyday life than that of the *Iliad* and the similes afford less contrast." Cf. Friedrich 1981: 133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Od. 2.420, 3.176, 3.183, 4.520, 4.585, 15.35, 15.292, 15.297, 17.148.

destroyed or diverted by unfavorable winds because of having offended a particular god. Menelaus's and Odysseus's returns are the most interesting in the poem precisely because the central importance of wind in their stories allows for the delays and plot turns through which a narrative can develop. There has been a great deal of theoretical speculation as to why a successful plot cannot travel directly from A to B but must always include detours and deviations. As Agamemnon's fate dramatizes in a different way, reaching the end too quickly, or achieving one's *nostos* too easily, leads by short-circuit to an "improper death." <sup>32</sup>

For Odysseus, the danger of the short-circuit is posed early in his narrative, when all the potentially distracting winds of his nostos and all the possible directions his plot could move in are gathered into a single bag by Aeolus and tied fast with a silver string. Through this action, Homer plays with the idea of binding all the unfavorable winds and banishing them from his epic, of allowing Odysseus to become a hero who is barely troubled by wind. Before setting off with his secured bag of winds, Odysseus is treated to a glimpse of the windless life in Aeolus's idyllic home. On an unruffled island enclosed by bronze walls, the god and his twelve children enjoy an existence of endless satisfaction, marked by feasting, happiness, and stories that are told without interruption (Od. 10.14-16).33 Aeolus's world, like the windless Isles of the Blessed, stands as an impossible symbol of the synchronicity and serenity Odysseus himself might enjoy at home (Od. 4.457). Indeed, upon leaving the island, Odysseus easily makes straight for Ithaca, borne by the West wind, and upon catching sight of the smoke coming from the fires of his homeland he falls asleep, happy in the knowledge that his journey is almost over. Even the smoke rises, deceptively, in an example of regular and aimless air movement.

Yet this is a troubling moment for the epic. Surely Odysseus's *nostos* cannot be ending so prematurely? It is thus inevitable that the crew must open the bag of winds, even though their act of doing so provides the story with too many potential plotlines at once. The opening of the bag performs an important narrative purpose, since the ship cannot be allowed to reach home this quickly or simply.<sup>34</sup> Homer treads a fine line in subjecting Odysseus to the series of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Brooks has argued, that "[t]he complication of the detour is related to the danger of short-circuit: the danger of reaching the end too quickly, of achieving the improper death" (1984: 103–4). Cf. Miller 1998: 66–74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> On the temporal and spatial significance of Aeolus and his island, see further Vidal-Naquet 1986 [1970]: 22, 28; Clay 1985; Detienne and Vernant 1991: 170–71n111.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup>On the affinities between the epic ship and plot, see Dougherty 2001. Clay 1985: 289 shows how the closed bag of winds corresponds closely to Odysseus's eventual return on the Phaeacians' magical ship (discussed later in the paper).

winds that delay his arrival home while at the same time composing a narrative that explicitly looks forward to an ending. The gods' actions in alternately stilling and rousing the winds interfere with the teleological program of the *nostos*, because the movement of events towards a goal is associated so readily in the *Odyssey* with the wind blowing in the right direction. Yet without these deviant winds, the story itself would have no space to develop.

From the start of the *Odyssey*, the forward movement of the poem takes hold through *ouroi*, the kind of favorable winds that Telemachus is blessed with on his travels and that Calypso bestows on Odysseus when he first leaves her island in book 5 (167, 268–69). But as the epic progresses it becomes clear that Odysseus has not been making it home this way. Instead, his journey has comprised a combination of encounters with storms and violent winds on the one hand and attempts to escape from the wind on the other. There is a paradox at work in Odysseus's *nostos*, taken over from a paradox that already existed in the *Iliad*, which is that Odysseus must reach the end only by grappling with winds that are either stilled or blowing so furiously that they impede forward direction.

Odysseus's passage to Scheria illustrates the various ways in which this paradox holds true, for it is threaded with the alternating motifs of an abundance of wind or a complete lack of it. First, Odysseus is washed up on the island by a storm set in motion by Poseidon. Here the winds that he experienced only metaphorically on the Trojan plain crowd together in a single force and threaten to obliterate the hero in a way that is, he claims, three or four times worse than dying in battle (*Od.* 5.306–12). In light of our earlier reading of Troy as a long-running metaphorical storm, Odysseus's comment is particularly revealing. In fact, the winds that destroy his raft are so close to their Iliadic counterparts that figurative poetics and narrative action threaten to collapse into one another (*Od.* 5.328–32):

ώς δ' ὅτ' ὁπωρινὸς Βορέης φορέησιν ἀκάνθας ἄμ πεδίον, πυκιναὶ δὲ πρὸς ἀλλήλησιν ἔχονται. 
ὡς τὴν ἄμ πέλαγος ἄνεμοι φέρον ἔνθα καὶ ἔνθαἄλλοτε μέν τε Νότος Βορέη προβάλεσκε φέρεσθαι, 
ἄλλοτε δ' αὖτ' Εὖρος Ζεφύρω εἴξασκε διώκειν.

As the North wind in autumn tumbles and tosses thistledown along the plain, and the bunches hold fast one on another, so the winds tossed [the raft] on the great sea, now here, now there, and now it would be South wind and North that pushed [it] between them, and then again East wind and West would burst in and follow.

The simile to which the wind that tosses the raft is compared is a classic Iliadic type, except that both the thistledown tossed in the wind *and* its referent, the raft tossed on the seas, come from the simile-bound world of nature. Now, in the context of the *Odyssey*, one half of that equation has been transferred to the realm of heroic action. Poseidon summons all four of the cardinal winds at once into the space of the *Odyssey*, jumbling together winds that do not occur in more than twos in the similes of the *Iliad*.<sup>35</sup>

It is difficult to untangle fully the significance of Poseidon's actions, for the winds he creates push Odysseus, in effect, into the epicenter of an Iliadic simile. Yet the winds that blow in the similes of the *Iliad* represent irrelevant or random occurrences. When, for example, the pitch of battle is compared to a wind that capsizes a sailor at sea, that sailor is always anonymous. In the *Odyssey*, Poseidon harnesses the symbolic force of these winds in an explicit bid to gain authorial control over Odysseus's story. The hero's response to this outburst of storms is to try to retreat from wind altogether. This first entails identifying whilst at sea a shelter from the wind (σκέπας ... ἀνέμοιο,*Od.*5.443). Once he has made it to shore, Odysseus lies breathless and speechless (ἄπνευστος καὶ ἄναυδος) on the sand (5.456–57), with water dripping from the mouth and nose through which he ought to be breathing. Afterwards, he searches for a place to sleep that will protect him from the "chilly wind that blows from the river" (5.469) and finds a small place covered over by bushes and leaves (5.476–93):

δοιούς δ' ἄρ' ὑπήλυθε θάμνους έξ ὁμόθεν πεφυῶτας ὁ μὲν φυλίης, ὁ δ' ἐλαίης. τοὺς μὲν ἄρ' οὔτ' ἀνέμων διάη μένος ὑγρὸν ἀέντων, οὔτε ποτ' ἠέλιος φαέθων ἀκτῖσιν ἔβαλλεν, οὔτ' ὄμβρος περάασκε διαμπερές τ τος ἄρα πυκνοὶ 480 άλλήλοισιν ἔφυν ἐπαμοιβαδίς· οὓς ὑπ' Ὀδυσσεὺς δύσετ'. ἄφαρ δ' εὐνὴν ἐπαμήσατο χερσὶ φίλησιν εὐρεῖαν· φύλλων γὰρ ἔην χύσις ἤλιθα πολλή, ὅσσον τ' ἠὲ δύω ἠὲ τρεῖς ἄνδρας ἔρυσθαι **ὅρη χειμερίη, εἰ καὶ μάλα περ χαλεπαίνοι.** 485 τὴν μὲν ἰδὼν γήθησε πολύτλας δῖος Ὀδυσσεύς, έν δ' ἄρα μέσση λέκτο, χύσιν δ' ἐπεχεύατο φύλλων. ώς δ' ὅτε τις δαλὸν σποδιῆ ἐνέκρυψε μελαίνη άγροῦ ἐπ' ἐσχατιῆς, ὧ μὴ πάρα γείτονες ἄλλοι, σπέρμα πυρός σώζων, ἵνα μή ποθεν ἄλλοθεν αὔοι, 490 ως Όδυσευς φύλλοισι καλύψατο. τῷ δ' ἄρ' Ἀθήνη

<sup>35</sup> Cf. Od. 5.291–96, 12.403–19.

ὕπνον ἐπ' ὄμμασι χεῦ', ἵνα μιν παύσειε τάχιστα δυσπονέος καμάτοιο, φίλα βλέφαρ' ἀμφικαλύψας.

[He] stopped underneath two bushes that grew from the same trunk, one of wild and one of cultivated olive,<sup>36</sup> and neither the force of wet-blowing winds could penetrate these nor could the shining sun ever strike through with his rays, nor yet could the rain pass all the way through them, so close together 480 were they grown, interlacing each other; and under these now Odysseus entered, and with his own hands heaped him a bed to sleep on, making it wide, since there was a great store of fallen leaves there, enough for two men to take cover in or even three men in the winter season, even in the very worst kind of weather. 485 Seeing this, long-suffering great Odysseus was happy, and lay down in the middle, and made a pile of leaves over him. As when a man buries a burning log in a black ash heap in a remote place in the country, where none live near as neighbors, and saves the seed of fire, having no other place to get a light 490 from, so Odysseus buried himself in the leaves, and Athene shed a sleep on his eyes so as most quickly to quit him, by veiling his eyes, from the exhaustion of his hard labors.

The still, windless space that Odysseus devises for himself under the leaves connects with several other still areas within the poem. Its language is almost identical to the description of the windless boar's lair piled over with leaves that is tucked into a hollow of windy Parnassus in the excursus on Odysseus's scar in book 19.<sup>37</sup> The scene also serves as a prelude to the stillness of Scheria, a land that is marked by the same kind of synchronic, magical time that defined Aeolus's island.<sup>38</sup> In the context of Odysseus's *nostos*, Scheria has been read as a regenerative and transitional space that temporarily offers a death-like oblivion to Odysseus as he passes from one world to another.<sup>39</sup>

 $<sup>^{36}</sup>$  Translation modified. The scholiasts and many modern scholars take φυλίης to mean wild olive here (Lattimore translates "shrub"). Cf. Schein 1970: 76n7, and 75–76 on other occurrences of the olive in the *Odyssey*, and Vidal-Naquet 1986 [1970]: 20, 26, 35n72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Od. 19.440–43, cf. Russo, Fernández-Galiano, and Heubeck 1992 ad loc. This lair, although it is the space from which the action of the hunt narrative springs and reaches its climax, nevertheless remains still and unchanging, like the timeless zone of description which stills the narrative when the scar is first spied by Eurycleia and like the unchanging nature of the scar itself on Odysseus's body (cf. Auerbach 2003 [1953]: 3–23). For a comparable windless passage in archaic Greek poetry, see Hes. Op. 519–25; Watkins 1978.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Od. 6.43; cf. 4.566–68; Vidal-Naquet 1986 [1970]: 28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Segal 1962; Segal 1974; Cook 1992.

But its otherworldly qualities make still more sense if understood in terms of the movement of breath and wind on the island, especially in the context of the poetics of Homeric wind as we have discussed them so far. Scheria exists outside the normal patterns of human time because it has only one wind blowing through it, the West wind, which ensures the constant growth of fruit in Alcinous's orchard.<sup>40</sup> This is also a land where ships are not shown to move with the wind, although they are equipped with sails.<sup>41</sup> As Alcinous cheerfully tells Odysseus, it really does not matter how far away he lives, a Phaeacian ship will still make it there and back in a day (7.317–26).

The stillness of Scheria is best emblematized by these ships that "strain with their own purpose" (8.556–60) rather than at the beckoning of the wind and that are as swift as thought or a winged bird (7.36). Not only do they require no steering oars, but they also cannot suffer damage, as ordinary ships in Homer do when they are battered by the winds (8.561–62). The speed at which the Phaeacian ships move is so otherworldly and independent of the normal rhythms of human time that they come close to not moving in time at all. It is no wonder, then, that during his windless passage home, Odysseus is covered over ( $\kappa\alpha\lambda \acute{\nu}\pi\tau\omega$ ) by a heavy sleep that is described as being most similar to death, that state in which the body stops breathing altogether (13.79–80). This slumber evokes Odysseus's sleep under the leaves at the end of book 5 and bears an association with the passage of the ship itself, which is also shrouded ( $\kappa\alpha\lambda \acute{\nu}\pi\tau\omega$ ) by clouds and mist on the journey to Ithaca and, on its return, is covered around ( $\mathring{\alpha}\mu\omega\kappa\lambda \acute{\nu}\pi\tau\omega$ ) by a great mountain, from that point remaining perfectly still forever.

The fate of the ship that ferries Odysseus home is an evocative symbol of the Phaeacians' windless state. Instead of being driven off course or broken to pieces by a storm, the vessel (flattened by Poseidon's hand and "rooted" in the sea) is stopped in time, as if destroyed by a thematic absence of wind. No

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> *Od.* 7.118–19. The West wind is the only wind to blow, continually and favorably, in order to refresh the mortals who inhabit the Islands of the Blessed (*Od.* 4.457). It is also the wind that blows Odysseus straight to Ithaca after he receives the bag from Aeolus. Calypso instructs Odysseus to sail in an easterly direction toward Scheria (*Od.* 5.272–77); presumably it is the West wind, therefore, that blows him there (a foreshadow of his renewal and "rebirth" on that island).

<sup>41</sup> Od. 6.269, 8.54, 8.372-76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Nausicaa mentions the sails and masts of their ships at *Od.* 6.269. At 8.54, the Phaeacians hoist the sails in preparation for Odysseus's journey. It bothered the scholiasts that the ship was left for so long with its sails up, but presumably this is part of the point—sails lose their relevance when there is no wind.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Od. 8.561–62, 8.569, 13.158, 13.177, 13.183. Cf. Segal 1962: 32.

gust will ever come in and animate this scene again. Nor, incidentally, will the breath of the poet's voice, which breaks away from the Phaeacians in the middle of a line (13.185–87). Scheria ends up as a landscape that is locked so definitively in a frozen moment of time that it cannot even move forward through the articulation of a spoken verse.<sup>44</sup>

The Phaeacians' story thereby symbolizes the extreme danger of the perfectly still landscape. We have seen how Odysseus comes close to the breathlessness of death when he enters and leaves Scheria, first by falling into an  $\alpha\pi\nu\epsilon\nu\sigma\tau\sigma\varsigma$  (breathless) state on the shore after his shipwreck and then by experiencing the sweetest painless ( $\nu\eta\delta\nu\mu\sigma\varsigma$ ) and unwaking ( $\nu\eta\gamma\rho\epsilon\tau\sigma\varsigma$ ) sleep, most like to death, on the way home to Ithaca (5.456–571; 3.79–80). We have also seen how Odysseus sleeps "covered over" with leaves on his first night on the island, in a sleep that also compares with death. At that moment he is likened to a glowing firebrand, an object that would need wind or breath to be brought back to life.

It would not be possible to make so much of the windless, breathless status of Odysseus's time on Scheria were it not for the fact that it is dramatically thematized in the famous simile comparing the weeping Odysseus to a woman watching her husband die in battle (*Od.* 8.523–26):

ώς δὲ γυνὴ κλαίησι φίλον πόσιν ἀμφιπεσοῦσα, ὅς τε ἑῆς πρόσθεν πόλιος λαῶν τε πέσησιν, ἀστεϊ καὶ τεκέεσσιν ἀμύνων νηλεὲς ἡμαρ· ἡ μὲν τὸν θνήσκοντα καὶ ἀσπαίροντα ἰδοῦσα ἀμφ' αὐτῷ χυμένη λίγα κωκύει.

As a woman weeps, lying over the body of her dear husband, who fell fighting for her city and people as he tried to beat off the pitiless day from city and children; she sees him dying and gasping for breath, and winding her body about him she cries high and shrill.

<sup>44</sup> Peradotto 1990: 81 observes how rare this kind of scene change within the Homeric hexameter is.

 $^{45}$  Od. 5.493, cf. 491. On Odysseus's death-like stupor, see Segal 1962: 45. See also West 1966 on *Theog.* 795–98 for his discussion of the νήυτμος, ἀνάπνευστος, and ἄναυδος sleep that the gods who break oaths are covered over with in Hesiod's Tartarus. As he states there, καλύπτω is used in Homer of the covering of death or unconsciousness, but never of natural sleep. In archaic and classical Greek funerary epigrams, καλύπτω is used of the earth's covering over of the corpse (Bruss 2005: 19–37).

I want to suggest a new interpretation of this simile within the context of Phaeacian time by arguing that Odysseus can be interpreted *both* as the woman, lamenting the dead and the past she must leave behind, *and* the fallen warrior, who, in dying in precisely the way that Odysseus is symbolically almost-dying on Scheria, is literally gasping for breath. <sup>46</sup> On the one hand, the simile reaffirms Odysseus as the hero of the *Odyssey*, traveling home and weeping at the remembrance of his past; on the other, it invites us to consider him as a character in the *Iliad*, who could easily have experienced the kind of death scene that the simile presents. Although Odysseus is explicitly compared to the weeping figure of the wife, he just as well resembles the man dying on the field, especially since, in the *Iliad*, similes are frequently applied to a character at the moment of his death. The passage takes Odysseus from being the attacker of Troy, in the story that moves him to tears, to being a man who defends his own city.

If we "un-reverse" the simile in this way, by seeing Odysseus in the figure of the dying man as well, we are brought back to our previous discussion of the *Iliad*.<sup>47</sup> The man is trying to catch his breath in the same way that the warriors did on the Trojan field. In that context, I discussed the warrior's labored breathing as an attempt to catch up or keep up with time. Here, however, the dying man's dwindling breath is set in a more complicated temporal frame. The figuratively dying Odysseus gasps in great gulps of air in an attempt to re-enter time, or in some way, perhaps, to escape the time of the *Iliad* and make his way into the era beyond the Trojan War.<sup>48</sup>

<sup>46</sup>The use of ἀσπαίρω to describe gasping at death occurs in the case of fatal injury on the battlefield ( $\it{Il}$ . 13.571, 573), Rhesus's slaughtered men ( $\it{Il}$ . 10.521), sacrificial animals ( $\it{Il}$ . 3.293), prey ( $\it{Il}$ . 12.203;  $\it{Od}$ . 19.229), fish brought out from the sea ( $\it{Od}$ . 12.254), Odysseus's men in the clutches of Scylla ( $\it{Od}$ . 12.255), and the heart panting out its last on the end of a spear ( $\it{Il}$ . 13.443).

<sup>47</sup> On the "reverse simile," see Foley 1978.

<sup>48</sup> Alternatively, Odysseus's gasping might remind the Homeric audience of a fish caught and brought out of water (as his men are so compared, also using ἀσπαίρω, when they are snatched by Scylla at *Od.* 12.254). The comparison of dying men to fish is not uncommon in Homer (cf. *Il.* 16.407; *Od.* 22.384). As one of my anonymous readers has suggested, perhaps the image-system of fish and fish killing in the *Odyssey* points to an essential plot dilemma of the poem as to whether Odysseus is a seaman or a landman. In other words, is Odysseus a figure essentially connected with Athena or—as his final journey might suggest—Poseidon? When, at the end of his life, Odysseus carries the double of a winnowing-fan inland before making sacrifices to Poseidon, he carries with him an instrument for creating an earthbound wind. The winnowing-fan differs from not only the oar for which it will be substituted but also the sail, which captures and holds wind rather than creates it.

Odysseus asked Demodocus to sing of these exploits in an attempt to set the process of narrative in motion within the still space of Scheria. This is vital both for his commemoration through the narrative of the horse and for the completion of his story through his return to Ithaca. Hearing about his heroic exploits with the Trojan horse makes Odysseus cry, an action that is expanded on by the illustration of the crying widow, the primary character in the simile. But as we probe further into the significance of the second, gasping figure in the simile, who I have suggested works as an alternative double for Odysseus, it is hard to discern whether the story of the Trojan horse is reviving our hero or suffocating him. It is not clear, in other words, whether the simile implies that Odysseus is gasping to escape his past at Troy, just as the chaotic stormwinds from the *Iliad*'s similes left him breathless on the shore, or whether he is suffocating instead in the airless vacuum of endless, magical time that holds him back from home.

Perhaps the best answer is that the gasping in the simile represents both at once. Odysseus uses the still space of Scheria to gain control over the winds blowing free from the *Iliad* and to prepare for his return to the post-heroic world of Ithaca. In order to move forward through his *nostos*, the kind of time that Odysseus needs to re-enter is that of the larger, more mundane world of the similes of the *Iliad*: the regular rhythms of weather, seasons, and ordinary life, where, as in Glaucus's famous formulation, the wind blows the leaves to the ground and the tree replenishes them again (*Il.* 6.145–49). Or he needs to find his way into the world inhabited by the Lumière family, where the continual background of the wind rustling in the leaves so easily escapes notice. The second half of the *Odyssey* moves towards establishing a normal, Ithacan time that was represented, from the very beginning, by the natural cycle of the Iliadic similes. After Odysseus returns home, winds start to work in a regular and predictable enough way so that action, including heroic action, becomes better integrated into the natural landscape of the poem.

### ITHACAN WIND AND TIME

There are indications that Odysseus and his story turn to a rhythm of natural cycles and calmer wind patterns on Ithaca, which temper the violent storm similes of the *Iliad*. In the second half of the poem, we are introduced to Laertes and Eumaeus, weather-beaten figures who both sleep outside, sheltered from the wind and yet exposed to the rough elements of nature. Telemachus continues to sail easily around the local geography of the Peloponnese with good, favorable winds, as his trip home in book 15 shows. In fact, strong winds rarely

blow through Odysseus's homeland.<sup>49</sup> Usually, they are found in reported speech (particularly in the lying tales) or, occasionally, in a simile.<sup>50</sup>

One might ask why Ithaca should be calm, since the turmoil in the palace would lead us to expect a less benign climate.<sup>51</sup> Yet the suitors are characterized by ongoing scenes of domestic disturbance, which—although there is a plot afoot to kill Telemachus—never spills over into vitality or action. It is ironic that the first question the ghost of Agamemnon poses to the suitor Amphimedon in the underworld is whether he was killed by Poseidon "rousing a stormblast / of battering winds" (*Od.* 24.109–110), since the suitors, in the house as at sea when they wait unsuccessfully in ambush for Telemachus's return (16.365), live within an environment of repetition and stasis. What they crave is change, an undoing of the status quo by means of a new marriage, yet they are trying to accomplish it in the wrong place and at the wrong time.

There is an increasing sense in the second half of the poem, moreover, that Odysseus, in reintegrating himself back into the space of home, is shutting out the wind. Two of the *Iliad*'s similes demonstrate how the well-joined beams of the house keep the wind out (*Il.* 16.212–14, 23.710–13):

ώς δ' ὅτε τοῖχον ἀνὴρ ἀράρῃ πυκινοῖσι λίθοισι δώματος ὑψηλοῖο, βίας ἀνέμων ἀλεείνων, ὣς ἄραρον κόρυθές τε καὶ ἀσπίδες ὀμφαλόεσσαι.

And as a man builds a solid wall with stones set close together for the rampart of a high house keeping out the force of the winds, so close together were the helms and shields massive in the middle.

ζωσαμένω δ' ἄρα τώ γε βάτην ἐς μέσσον ἀγῶνα, ἀγκὰς δ' ἀλλήλων λαβέτην χερσὶ στιβαρῆσιν ώς ὅτ' ἀμείβοντες, τούς τε κλυτὸς ἤραρε τέκτων δώματος ὑψηλοῖο, βίας ἀνέμων ἀλεείνων.

<sup>49</sup> The exception is book 14, where a West wind blows hard on Eumaeus's hut (*Od.* 14.458–59, 529–34). We learn at 13.99–101 that the Ithacan harbor is very well protected from the wind.

<sup>50</sup> Wind in the lying tales: *Od.* 13.276, 13.326, 14.253, 14.299, 14.475, 19.186, 19.200; wind in similes: 19.204–9, 23.233–40.

<sup>51</sup>Note the difference between the role of wind in Homer's Ithaca and Aeschylus's Argos. Clytemnestra's palace in the *Oresteia* is crowded with ominous, symbolic winds, which revitalize the curse from generation to generation until the murderous breath and blasts of the Furies are calmed by Athena (Scott 1966). Quite a different situation is at play on Ithaca, where the return of Odysseus looks forward to the *end* of a storyline rather than, as with Agamemnon's return, the beginning of one.

The two men, girt up, strode out into the midst of the circle, and grappled each other in the hook of their heavy arms, as when rafters lock, when a renowned architect has fitted them in the roof of a high house to keep out the force of the winds' spite.

Now, in the *Odyssey*, we find that Odysseus's and Penelope's home is similarly wind-resistant. It is noteworthy that the plan for killing the suitors hinges on the close-fitting doors in Odysseus's house being kept shut (κληῗσαι μεγάροιο θύρας πυκινῶς ἀραρυίας, 21.382), in order that the women stay inside the thalamos and the suitors not escape during the slaughter.<sup>52</sup> There is also Odysseus's command to Telemachus that the weapons be stored away in order that, ostensibly, they not become damaged by the "breath" (ἀϋτμή) of smoke from the fire (16.290). Indeed, the plan is nearly foiled when Telemachus leaves the door ajar (22.155-56). This surely explains, too, why not a single wind simile exists among the many similes of violence in book 22, the Odyssey's domestic "battle book." Finally, the projected movement towards stillness also adds further resonance to the long tradition of scholarship on the still space of Odysseus's and Penelope's bedroom, whose well-made doors are guarded and kept firmly shut (κολλητὰς δ' ἐπέθηκα θύρας, πυκινῶς ἀραρυίας).<sup>53</sup> It is not only that the bedroom has to be thought of as "rooted" and fixed in place<sup>54</sup>; it also works effectively to shut out various kinds of winds and time. This is especially true given that the olive from which the bed is carved is the same kind of tree as the one under which Odysseus found a windless calm at the end of book 5.55

Penelope is the only figure on Ithaca who is associated with wind, through its use in two similes and through her once-stated desire to be swept away by stormwinds (20.63–79). In book 19, upon hearing false news of Odysseus, Penelope weeps like snow pushed off a mountain by the wind (204–9) and in book 23 she is famously compared to a shipwrecked sailor swimming to shore having escaped the force of the winds (233–40). Here, in Penelope's last simile, the reference to wind does not signal action that is either about to take place or already in motion. Instead it signals a point when the wind has died down, and the action of the narrative is drawing again towards stillness.

 $<sup>^{52}</sup>$  Cf. the ὀρσοθύρη of Od. 22.126, of which Homer says σανίδες δ' ἔχον εὖ ἀραρυῖαι (22.128).

<sup>53</sup> Od. 23.194, 23.239.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> See esp. Zeitlin 1996.

 $<sup>^{55}</sup>$  Note that the bushes that the wind could not pass through there were πυκνοί (*Od.* 5.480-11; cf. πυκινῶς ἀραρυῖας to describe the Ithacan doors, above).

In the last book of the *Odyssey*, the question of whether the narrative has really reached a still or windless space is left deliberately unresolved. The story does not continue to be moved by wind in the way that, as we hear in book 24, happens at Troy beyond the end of the *Iliad*.<sup>56</sup>

As we end with an *Odyssey* in which there is largely no wind, we return, in effect, to the beginning of this paper, where I discussed the paucity of tangible, literal winds in the *Iliad*. It is still true, as Fränkel said, that "in the *Iliad* ... there is hardly any weather," but a close examination of what that weather does suggests subtle revisions for our understanding of how epic storylines are sustained, and how their movement through time is influenced by the force of the winds that occur in them. As a coda to this point, in the last section of this paper I will look briefly at how wind works as a narrative motif that blows through and beyond the Homeric tradition.

# THE INTERTEXTUAL FORCE OF WIND

In book 20 of the *Odyssey*, Penelope famously recapitulates a wish of Helen's from the *Iliad* when she yearns for the kind of stormwind (θύελλα) that might sweep her up and "make her vanish" (ἀϊστόω, 20.63–66, 77, 79)<sup>57</sup>:

ἢ ἔπειτά μ' ἀναρπάξασα θύελλα οἰχέοιτο προφέρουσα κατ' ἠερόεντα κέλευθα ἐν προχοῆς δε βάλοι ἀψορρόου Ὠκεανοῖο, ὡς δ' ὅτε Πανδαρέου κούρας ἀνέλοντο θύελλαι	65
 τόφρα δὲ τὰς κούρας ἄρπυιαι ἀνηρείψαντο	77
 ὣς ἔμ' ἀϊστώσειαν Ὀλύμπια δώματ' ἔχοντες.	79
[Or how I wish that] soon the stormwind would snatch me away, and be gone, carrying me down misty pathways, and set me down where the recurrent Ocean empties his stream; as once the stormwinds carried away the daughters of Pandareos	65
•••	

<sup>56</sup> Od. 24.41–42, where Agamemnon tells Achilles about the fight over his body: ἡμεῖς δὲ πρόπαν ἦμαρ ἐμαρνάμεθ'· οὐδέ κε πάμπαν / παυσάμεθα πτολέμου, εἰ μὴ Ζεὺς λαίλαπι παῦσεν ("We fought on the whole day long, nor would we ever / have stopped fighting, if Zeus had not stopped us with a whirlstorm"). Here again the Odyssey sets wind within the space of the plain at Troy, a move that the *Iliad* resists.

<sup>57</sup> On the motif of abduction by the winds, see further Nagy 1990: 242–45; Nagy 1999 [1979]: 193–204.

meanwhile the seizing stormwinds carried away these maidens	77
So I wish that they who have their homes on Olympos would make me vanish.	79

In the *Iliad*, Helen fantasized about a gust of wind that might have swept her away long before the Trojan War began (*Il.* 6.345–48):

ώς μ' ὄφελ' ἤματι τῷ ὅτε με πρῶτον τέκε μήτηρ οἴχεσθαι προφέρουσα κακὴ ἀνέμοιο θύελλα εἰς ὄρος ἢ εἰς κῦμα πολυφλοίσβοιο θαλάσσης ἔνθα με κῦμ' ἀπόερσε πάρος τάδε ἔργα γενέσθαι.

How I wish that on that day when my mother first bore me the foul whirlwind of the storm had caught me away and swept me to the mountain, or into the wash of the sea deep-thundering where the waves would have swept me away before all these things had happened.

Helen and Penelope both wish that the kind of harsh weather usually found only in the Iliadic simile could have broken into the narrative frame and swept them out of their poem's existence. They desire the kinds of winds that will remove them from the relentless progression of heroic and narrative time. Interestingly, their wishes for themselves coincide with one of the most serious causes of concern for the epic hero. Being snatched by stormwinds is the fate most worried about for Odysseus and Telemachus (*Od.* 1.241–42, 4.727–28; cf. 5.419–20, 14.371):

νῦν δέ μιν ἀκλειῶς Ἅρπυιαι ἀνηρείψαντο· 1.241 οἴχετ' ἄϊστος, ἄπυστος.

But now ingloriously the stormwinds have caught and carried him away, out of sight, out of knowledge.

νῦν αὖ παῖδ' ἀγαπητὸν ἀνηρείψαντο θύελλαι 4.727 ἀκλέα ἐκ μεγάρων, οὐδ' ὁρμηθέντος ἄκουσα.

And now again the stormwinds have caught away my beloved son, without trace, from the halls, and I never heard when he left me.

These lines betray anxiety about the loss of *kleos* that would come with the disappearance of the hero. But Helen's wish to go all the way back to the very day of her birth, beyond the beginning of the Trojan war, is not about fading out of a heroic plot in the middle but about attempting to reverse it altogether, by making the whole story of the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey* vanish into thin air. In

Euripides' *Helen*, Hera does precisely this when she remakes the *Iliad* in the image of a war fought over a wisp of air (Eur. *Hel.* 31–35; my translation):

Ήρα δὲ μεμφθεῖσ' οὕνεκ' οὐ νικᾳ θεάς, ἐξηνέμωσε τἄμ' Ἀλεξάνδρῳ λέχη, δίδωσι δ' οὐκ ἔμ' ἀλλ' ὁμοιώσασ' ἐμοὶ εἴδωλον ἔμπνουν οὐρανοῦ ξυνθεῖσ' ἄπο Πριάμου τυράννου παιδί.

Hera, angry because she was not victorious over the other goddesses, "blew to nothing" (*ex-anemoō*) my affair with Alexander, she did not give him me but, likening to me an image breathing the air of heaven, she placed it beside the son of king Priam.

The idea that Hera, goddess of the *aer*, might "blow to nothing" an established epic plot is carried further by Virgil, who uses Juno to divert the course of Aeneas, and with him the plot of the epic, by persuading Aeolus to release all of the winds and shipwreck the Trojans off the coast of Carthage. The powerful storm Juno musters at the beginning of the epic acts as a whirlwind of Homeric referents, as she piles wind upon wind in an effort not only to divert Virgil's *Aeneid* but also to destroy it by means of winds that blow directly from the *Iliad*. Her own wrath has long been recognized as an Iliadic motif, especially since the identification of the *Iliad*'s opening word (μῆνιν) in the first words of Juno's opening speech (*mene incepto*). <sup>58</sup> Thus Juno, like her Greek counterpart, attempts on the one hand to stop and revise a plot before it has even begun and on the other to restart the plot of the *Iliad* by the use of Iliadic storms. <sup>59</sup>

Juno's winds, once unleashed, mix up texts and storylines still further. As critics have noted, the storm goes so far as to break apart, physically, the very first words this time of the *Aeneid* (*arma virum tabulaeque et Troia gaza per undas*, 1.119).<sup>60</sup> Here *arma virumque cano* (1.1) is broken in two by the strength of the winds, with a plank that is also a writing tablet (*tabula*) floating up in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Verg. Aen. 1.37; cf. saeuae memorem Iunonis ob iram at 1.5. Levitan 1993: 14–15; Fowler 1997: 259–61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup>Interestingly, Juno is forced to invoke storms that occur for the most part before and after the *Iliad*'s time frame (Aulis; the storm during the fight for Achilles' body) or in its similes. Commentators have observed that the stormwinds released by Aeolus at Juno's bidding in book 1 are evocative of Poseidon's shipwreck of Odysseus in book 5 of the *Odyssey*, except that Virgil overlays this scene with the conversation between Juno and Aeolus, which is evocative of *Iliad* 14, where Hera bribes Sleep.

<sup>60</sup> See especially Oliensis 2004.

the middle and Virgil's original *cano* lost to the winds. Indeed, the *tabula*'s unexpected appearance within the hexameter, forced in by the unruly winds, speaks to Juno's plot to capsize all of Virgil's *Troia gaza*.<sup>61</sup>

Scholars such as Hardie have shown that, for Virgil, stormwinds are major textual markers, signaling beginnings and endings, and also that they emerge out of a long epic tradition. <sup>62</sup> While some have pointed to the typhoon winds and the Titans imprisoned in Hesiod's *Theogony* as an antecedent to the several stormwinds in Roman epic, it is also helpful in this context to turn to the Hesiodic passages from the *Catalogue of Women* that outline the beginning of the Trojan War (Hes. fr. 204.95–100, 124–29 M-W, translation Most 2007):

πάντες δὲ θεοὶ δίχα θυμὸν ἔθεντο ἐξ ἔριδος· δὴ γὰρ τότε μήδετο θέσκελα ἔργα Ζεὺς ὑψιβρεμέτης, †μεῖξαι κατ' ἀπείρονα γαῖαν τυρβάξας,† ἤδη δὲ γένος μερόπων ἀνθρώπων πολλὸν ἀϊστῶσαι σπε̞ῦδ̞ε, πρ̞[ό]φασιν μὲν ὀλέσθαι ψυχὰς ἡμιθέω[ν.	95
ψυχας ημισεωίν.	100
All the gods were divided in spirit in strife. For high-thundering Zeus was devising wondrous deeds then, to stir up trouble (τυρβάξας) on the boundless earth;	95
for he was already eager to annihilate most of the race	
of speech-endowed human beings, a pretext to destroy the lives of the semi-gods.	100
πο <sub>1</sub> λλὰ δ' ἀπὸ γλωθρῶν δενδρέων ἀμύοντα χαμᾶζε χεύετο καλὰ πέτηλα, ῥέεσκε δὲ καρπὸς ἔραζε π]γείοντος Βορέαο περιζαμενὲς Διὸς αἴσηι, .]΄ λεσκεν δὲ θάλασσα, τρόμ{ε}εσκε δὲ πάντ' ἀπὸ τοῖο, τρύχεσκεν δὲ μένος βρότεον, μινύθεσκε δὲ καρπός, ϣρηι ἐν εἰαρινῆι	125
Many stately trees bowing down to the ground shed their beautiful leaves, and the fruit fell to earth as Boreas blew violently by Zeus' dispensation and the sea [swelled], and everything trembled from it, and it consumed mortal strength, and the fruit was diminished in the spring season	125

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> As expressed to me by Joseph Farrell.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Hardie 1993: 60–65, 1986: 90–97; cf. Oliensis 2004. Murrin 1980: 3–25 discusses Juno's role as goddess of the air. See also Bonner 1966 on the rhetorical exercise of the *descriptio tempestatis*.

These lines are difficult to interpret,  $^{63}$  but it is clear that the competition for Helen's hand and the beginning of the Trojan War are connected to the story of a great storm that Zeus sends upon mortal men in an effort to make them disappear. Note that the verb ἀϊστόω was used by Penelope and is from the same root as the adjective (ἄϊστος) used of Odysseus in the examples above. Each of these passages reflect on Helen's sentiments in book 6 of the *Iliad* and express a similar conceit: the wiping out of Homeric epic altogether, either before it has begun or before it has been completed.

The storm from the *Catalogue of Women* marks, as has been suggested, the beginning of the Trojan War, especially given Clay's association of it with the storm at Aulis. It may also express the beginning of seasonal time, at the end of the heroic age, with the appearance of the first autumn. <sup>64</sup> Just as the storm sets heroic time in motion, therefore, it also threatens to obliterate it and hold it back, by either delaying the Greeks at Aulis or wiping them out without trace. These storms, as I have noted, have been well documented for their intertextual connections. I have suggested here that they are also connected with a history of wind in all its guises, through a poem which, although "weatherless" at first glance, increasingly draws the movement of the air into its spheres of action and association.

#### WORKS CITED

Auerbach, E. 2003 [1953]. Mimesis: The Representation of Reality in Western Literature. Trans. by W. R. Trask. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Bakker, E. J. 2001. "Similes, Augment, and the Language of Immediacy." In Watson, ed. 1–23.

Barra-Salzédo, E. 2007. En soufflant la grâce: âmes, souffles et humeurs en Grèce ancienne. Grenoble: Millon.

Bonner, S. F. 1966. "Lucan and the Declamation Schools." AJP 87: 257–89.

Brooks, P. 1984. Reading for the Plot: Design and Intention in Narrative. New York: Knopf.

Bruss, J. S. 2005. *Hidden Presences: Monuments, Gravesites and Corpses in Greek Funerary Epigram.* Louvain: Peeters.

Chantraine, P. 1968–80. *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue grecque*. 2 vols. Paris: Klincksieck.

Chatman, S. 1980. "What Novels Can Do That Films Can't (and Vice Versa)." *Critical Inquiry* 7: 121–40.

Clay, J. S. 1985. "Aeolia, or under the Sign of the Circle." CJ 80: 289–91.

<sup>63</sup> Compare now on the first passage the contribution by José M. González in this volume.

64 Clay 2005: 30-35; West 1961: 133-36.

- ——— 2005. "The Beginning and End of the *Catalogue of Women* and its Relation to Hesiod." In Hunter, ed. 25–34.
- Coffey, M. 1957. "The Function of the Homeric Simile." AJP 78: 113–32.
- Cook, E. 1992. "Ferrymen of Elysium and the Homeric Phaeacians." JIES 20: 239-67.
- Detienne, M. and Vernant, J.-P. 1991. *Cunning Intelligence in Greek Culture and Society*. Trans. by J. Lloyd. Chicago: University of Chicago Press (French 1974).
- Dougherty, C. 2001. *The Raft of Odysseus: The Ethnographic Imagination of Homer's* Odyssey. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Edwards, M. W. 1987. *Homer: Poet of the* Iliad. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Foley, H. 1978. "'Reverse Similes' and Sex Roles in the Odyssey." Arethusa 11: 7–26.
- Fowler, D. P. 1991. "Narrate and Describe: The Problem of Ekphrasis." JRS 81: 25–35.
- ———— 1997. "Virgilian Narrative: Story-telling." In Martindale, C. ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Virgil.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 259–70.
- Fränkel, H. 1921. Die homerischen Gleichnisse. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- 1997. "Essence and Nature of the Homeric Simile." In Wright, G. M. and Jones, P. V. eds. *Homer: German Scholarship in Translation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 103–23 [= translation of Fränkel 1921, pp. 98–114].
- Friedrich, R. 1981. "On the Compositional Use of Similes in the *Odyssey.*" *AJP* 102: 120–37.
- Frisk, H. 1954-70. Griechisches etymologisches Wörterbuch. Heidelberg: Winter.
- Genette, G. 1976. "Boundaries of Narrative." NLH 8: 1-13.
- Gunning, T. 1989. "An Aesthetic of Astonishment: Early Film and the (In)credulous Spectator." *Art and Text* 34: 31–45.
- Hardie, P. 1986. Virgil's Aeneid: Cosmos and Imperium. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hunter, R. L. ed. 2005. *The Hesiodic Catalogue of Women*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kakridis, J. T. 1949. Homeric Researches. Lund: Gleerup.
- Lattimore, R. 1951. The Iliad of Homer. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- ———— 1965. *The* Odyssey of Homer. New York: HarperCollins.
- Lesher, J. H. 1981. "Perceiving and Knowing in the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*." *Phronesis* 26: 2-24.
- Levitan, W. 1993. "Give Up the Beginning? Juno's Mindful Wrath (*Aeneid* I.37)." *LCM* 18: 1–15.
- Martin, R. P. 1997. "Similes and Performance." In Bakker, E. and Kahane, A. eds. Written Voices, Spoken Signs: Tradition, Performance, and the Epic Text. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 56–82.
- ——— 2005. "Pulp Epic: The *Catalogue* and the *Shield*." In Hunter, ed. 153–75.
- Miller, J. H. 1998. Reading Narrative. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Minchin, E. 2001. "Similes in Homer: Image, Mind's Eye, and Memory." In Watson, ed. 25–52.
- Most, G. W. 2007. *Hesiod: The* Shield, Catalogue of Women, *and other Fragments*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- Murrin, M. 1980. *The Allegorical Epic: Essays in its Rise and Decline*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Nagy, G. 1990. Greek Mythology and Poetics. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- ——— 1999 [1979]. The Best of the Achaeans: Concepts of the Hero in Archaic Greek Poetry. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Oliensis, E. 2004. "Sibylline Syllables: The Intratextual Aeneid." PCPS 50: 29-45.
- Peradotto, J. 1990. *Man in the Middle Voice: Name and Narration in the* Odyssey. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Porter, D. H. 1972. "Violent Juxtaposition in the Similes of the *Iliad*." CJ 68: 11–21.
- Redfield, J. M. 1994. *Nature and Culture in the* Iliad: *The Tragedy of Hector.* Expanded ed. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Rosen, R. M. 1990. "Poetry and Sailing in Hesiod's Works and Days." ClAnt 9: 99-113.
- Russo, C. F., Fernández-Galiano, M., and Heubeck, A. 1992. *A Commentary on Homer's* Odyssey. Vol. 3. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Schein, S. L. 1970. "Odysseus and Polyphemus in the Odyssey." GRBS 11: 73-83.
- Scott, W. C. 1966. "Wind Imagery in the Oresteia." TAPA 97: 459-71.
- ———— 1974. *The Oral Nature of the Homeric Simile*. Leiden: Brill.
- ——— 2005. "The Patterning of the Similes in Book 2 of the *Iliad*," In Rabel, R. J. ed. *Approaches to Homer: Ancient and Modern.* Swansea: Classical Press of Wales. 21–54.
- Segal, C. 1962. "The Phaeacians and the Symbolism of Odysseus' Return." *Arion* 1.4: 17–64.
- Smith, W. D. 1966. "Physiology in the Homeric Poems." TAPA 97: 547–56.
- Stern, L. 2004. "Paths That Wind through the Thicket of Things." In Brown, B. ed. *Things*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 393–430.
- Vidal-Naquet, P. 1986 [1970]. "Land and Sacrifice in the Odyssey." In id. The Black Hunter: Forms of Thought and Forms of Society in the Greek World. Trans. by A. Szegedy-Maszak. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 15–38.
- Watkins, C. 1978. "ANOΣΤΕΟΣ 'ΟΝ ΠΟΔΑ ΤΕΝΔΕΙ." In (no ed.) Étrennes de septantaine: travaux de linguistique et de grammaire comparée offerts à Michel Lejeune par un groupe de ses élèves. Paris: Klincksieck. 231–35.
- Watson, J. ed. 2001. Speaking Volumes: Orality and Literacy in the Greek and Roman World. Leiden: Brill.
- West, M. L. 1961. "Hesiodea." CQ 11: 130-45.
- ——— 1966. *Hesiod's Theogony*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Whitman, C. H. 1958. *Homer and the Heroic Tradition*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Zeitlin, F. I. 1996. "Figuring Fidelity in Homer's *Odyssey*." In *ead. Playing the Other: Gender and Society in Classical Greek Literature*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 19–52.